

# Learning about racism: A week-by-week qualitative exploration of two white Dutch primary student teachers' emotional responses during a Critical Race Theory based course

**Author(s)**

Soeterik, Inti M. ; Hanna, Fadie; Öztemir, Tugba

**DOI**

[10.1016/j.stueduc.2023.101282](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.stueduc.2023.101282)

**Publication date**

2023

**Document Version**

Final published version

**Published in**

Studies in Educational Evaluation

**License**

CC BY

[Link to publication](#)

**Citation for published version (APA):**

Soeterik, I. M., Hanna, F., & Öztemir, T. (2023). Learning about racism: A week-by-week qualitative exploration of two white Dutch primary student teachers' emotional responses during a Critical Race Theory based course. *Studies in Educational Evaluation*, 78, Article 101282. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.stueduc.2023.101282>

**General rights**

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

**Disclaimer/Complaints regulations**

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please contact the library: <https://www.amsterdamuas.com/library/contact/questions>, or send a letter to: University Library (Library of the University of Amsterdam and Amsterdam University of Applied Sciences), Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.



## Learning about racism: A week-by-week qualitative exploration of two white Dutch primary student teachers' emotional responses during a Critical Race Theory based course<sup>☆</sup>

Inti M. Soeterik<sup>c,1</sup>, Fadie Hanna<sup>a,b,\*</sup>, Tugba Öztemir<sup>a</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Amsterdam University of Applied Sciences, Amsterdam, the Netherlands

<sup>b</sup> Erasmus University Rotterdam, Rotterdam, the Netherlands

<sup>c</sup> Fawaka Wereldburgerschap, Amsterdam, the Netherlands

### ARTICLE INFO

#### Keywords:

Critical Race Theory  
Anti-racist development  
White student teachers  
Diary method

### ABSTRACT

This qualitative study explored emotional responses of two white Dutch student teachers during a Critical Race Theory (CRT) based course. Following Plutchik's (2001) classification of 32 emotions, the analysis of their weekly diaries resulted in the identification of 16 emotions. In both diaries similar emotional responses were identified. However, the analysis did not reveal a straightforward path these students emotionally went through. The number and types of emotional responses, both comfortable and uncomfortable, fluctuated weekly and occurred simultaneously in various combinations. Even when similar emotional responses were identified, students connected differently to the course content. This could be explained by different starting points both students had when entering the course. The findings add to past work by identifying a variety and complexity of emotional responses of white student teachers during a CRT based course and can be used to create course conditions to prepare teachers for contributing to anti-racist education.

In the Netherlands, as in many countries in Northwestern Europe, a substantial part of white student teachers is still in need of conceptual knowledge and consciousness about racism at the end of their teacher training program (e.g., Agirdag et al., 2016; Kennedy et al., 2023; Mikander et al., 2018; Svendsen, 2014; Weiner, 2015). Researchers have argued that as long as student teachers do not develop this knowledge and consciousness, they are less well prepared to contribute to the inclusion and social justice aims of education (Sleeter, 2017). For example, it has been reported that some white student teachers experience difficulties in forming constructive relationships with students of color and their caretakers, struggle to build bridges between the lived experiences of students of color and teaching content, and report low engagement and disinterest in learning and/or low academic potential (Gundara & Portera, 2008; Savenije et al., 2014; Thijs & Verkuyten, 2013; Weiner, 2015). Moreover, white student teachers with insufficient knowledge about racism seem to impede the motivation to teach at schools where the majority of students are of color (Sleeter, 2017). This adds to an increased use of substitute, out-of-subject teachers or even not certified

teachers, which in turn jeopardizes the quality of education.

One way to increase white student teachers' knowledge of racism is by providing them with courses designed on the basis of Critical Race Theory (CRT; Ladson-Billings & Tate, 2016). CRT is an interdisciplinary approach to racial inequality, aimed at understanding and combating it (Dixson & Rousseau, 2005). This approach recognizes race as a socially constructed identity that plays an important role in the formation of society and inequality therein. In CRT, racism is not considered as an individual manifestation of hatred. Instead, the theory focuses on "examining the social structuring of racism as a complex, changing, and often subtle aspect of society that works for the benefit of white people (Gillborn & Ladson-Billings, 2020). Therefore, examining the implications of whiteness, power structures, privilege, and racism in people's everyday lives is an inherent part of CRT. This perspective not only might help student teachers in empowering students of color, but also in becoming themselves a committed role model for social justice (Sleeter, 2017). As such CRT helps white student teachers in particular to more accurately detect and tackle racism in textbooks, among their students

<sup>☆</sup> This research was supported by grant 405.17865.092 from the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research.

\* Corresponding author at: Amsterdam University of Applied Sciences, Amsterdam, the Netherlands.

E-mail address: [f.hanna@hva.nl](mailto:f.hanna@hva.nl) (F. Hanna).

<sup>1</sup> Authors are listed in random order and share first authorship.

(Apfelbaum et al., 2010), in their own pedagogy (Weiner, 2014), and in interactions with caretakers (Howard & Reynolds, 2008).

There have been some studies describing CRT based courses and workshops for white student teachers (see for an overview of the studies before 2019; Sleeter, 2001; Hambacher & Ginn, 2021). These studies seem to have in common an emphasis on what student teachers learned about racism or on becoming aware of how racism works (cf. Hambacher & Ginn, 2021). Aronson and Meyers (2022), for example, were interested in the understandings student teachers revealed over a 15-week semester while learning through a CRT based framework. One of the things they found was that students needed more CRT based courses throughout the curriculum and more time to master the concepts of racism and whiteness. In another study, Smith (2020) indicated that the use of critical texts was helpful in supporting student teachers to become aware of privileges and prejudices resulting from their positionality. Aronson et al. (2020), finally, implemented a counternarrative approach by sharing stories about the lived experiences of African American students. Their findings revealed this has been a successful way to expose and critique normalized discussions that perpetuate racial stereotypes regarding these students.

At the same time, it is recognized that deconstructing the social constructions of race and analyzing interlocking systems of oppression that challenge or alter one's own perspective is an experience characterized by emotional engagement (Marx & Pennington, 2003). For instance, one study found emotional responses expressed in student teachers' writings about their experience when learning about racism from a critical point of view (Solomona et al., 2005). Another study revealed that particular critical race related documentaries evoked emotional response among student teachers (Smith, 2014). More recent research came to similar conclusions as white students displayed emotions through tears and body language when critically discussing racism (Eriksen & Stein, 2021). These findings suggest that in addition to intellectual responses, emotional responses need to be taken into account when teaching student teachers about racism from a CRT perspective (cf. Delano-Oriaran & Parks, 2015; Zembylas, 2012). More specifically, white student teachers who understand how certain (un)conscious prejudices and biases connect with their emotions might be better able to suspend their judgements, analyze and understand the critical literature, and empathize with the lived experiences of people of color. The importance of emotions for learning is also reflected in the wider discussions about the link between both concepts (for an overview, see Pekrun, 2014). For example, emotions are related to students' levels of motivation and modify the choice of learning strategies. Studies focusing on primary student teachers' professional development, for instance, also underscore the importance of emotions, notably suggesting that emotions affect student teachers' professional identity development (cf. Hanna et al., 2019; Hanna et al., 2022).

However, despite the relationship between learning about racism based on a CRT perspective and emotional responses, little research has revealed the multiplicity and complexity of emotional responses (Pezetti, 2017). Several studies about white people's expressed emotions in becoming racially aware portray a straightforward way of processing emotions by going through certain phases (e.g., Lawrence & Tatum, 1997; Spanierman & Cabrera, 2015). Similar observations have been made in research into white students' teachers' racial awareness (e.g., Tatum, 1992). Generally, these studies present a picture of white students first demonstrating strong resistance and shutting themselves off from learning as a consequence of anger, disapproval or frustration, while later showing interest, openness, and increased participation.

In contrast, based on various studies about student teachers' emotions, it is possible to expect that white students can also experience multiple comfortable and uncomfortable emotions at the same time or in very close temporal proximity (cf. Kelchtermans & Deketelaere, 2016). These emotions might appear in various combinations, and/or can be congruent (for example, one might feel interest and enthusiasm at the same time) or contradictory (for instance, one might feel sad and

interested at the same time). Accordingly, various practices such as taking exams, interacting with peers, and teaching students seem to trigger a wide range of emotions during teacher education (Anttila et al., 2016). To our best knowledge, only one study has explored the multiplicity and complexity of emotions during a CRT based course in the context of a primary student teacher training course (de Oliveira Andreotti et al., 2014). Results from this study reveal that student teachers navigated through different phases during the course in which they elaborated on the course content in various ways and experienced multiple emotions at the same time.

Additionally, white student teachers have often been studied as a homogenous group, with little attention to their experiences as individuals (e.g., DeCuir-Gunby et al., 2020; Lander, 2011). However, next to white student teachers' collective experience, they also possess personal experiences that are different from others, resulting in various ways of making meaning out of CRT content (cf. Johnson, 2002; McIntyre, 1997). Thus, having an eye for heterogeneity among white student teachers makes it possible to create a more comprehensive understanding of how teacher education can work towards CRT based courses that support this group of student consciousness and understanding of racism (Davis, 2009).

Our research makes a valuable contribution to the literature by exploring the emotional responses of two white student teachers on a weekly basis, using personal diaries as an approach to analyzing racism in the field of teacher education. Specifically, we aim to investigate the largely unexplored area of the dominant white, middle-class, ethnocentric perspective that is often prevalent among teacher training students (cf. Aronson & Meyers, 2022; Weiner, 2015). By doing so, we hope to highlight the multiplicity and complexity of emotional responses and reveal the personal journeys of white student teachers, rather than treating them as a homogeneous group. This study underscores the importance of designing more detailed and customized learning trajectories, including curricular choices, pedagogies, and interventions, to better prepare white student teachers to contribute to the inclusion and social justice goals of education. Through our research, we aim to provide insights that can inform the development of more effective and equitable approaches to teacher training, ultimately promoting a more just and inclusive society.

Throughout history emotions have been studied by various researchers in the fields of psychology, educational sciences, anthropology, and medicine amongst others (Chatterjee et al., 2019). Given the broad field in which the concept of emotions is studied, there is no consensus on the precise definition and classification of emotions. One often used framework for understanding and categorizing emotions is Plutchik's wheel of emotions (2001; Chatterjee et al., 2019). This framework considers the construct of emotion as a response to stimuli (i.e. events, situations, or contexts). Additionally, types of emotions can occur both simultaneously and sequentially, can be of opposite valence, and change in a nonlinear manner. Specifically, Plutchik's (2001) work defines a spectrum of 32 emotions, including for example optimism, love, submission, awe, disapproval, remorse, contempt, and aggressiveness. This spectrum provides us the opportunity to make a first step in inventorying the variety and complexity of white student teachers' emotional responses during a CRT based course.

The aim of this qualitative study is to report on two white student teachers' emotional responses during a CRT based course. Gaining insight into this issue could be useful for teacher education programs preparing professionals to act as agents of inclusion and social justice in education, both in the Netherlands and in other Northwestern European countries (e.g., Belgium, Norway, and Sweden), where the majority of white student teachers grapple with similar race-related issues (Mikander et al., 2018).

## 1. The Dutch context

Studies about CRT in teacher education have mostly been conducted

in New Zealand (de Oliveira Andreotti et al., 2014), the United States (Howard & Rodriguez-Scheel, 2017), and the United Kingdom (Cole, 2017). Emotional responses of white student teachers during such CRT based courses in the Netherlands, remains to be investigated. To date, most teacher training programs in the Netherlands include diversity courses that focus on appreciating diversity, developing certain multicultural competencies, and gaining knowledge about specific ethnic groups (Severiens et al., 2014). However, the programs do not discuss diversity issues in education from a CRT lens (Weiner, 2015). Many courses tend to emphasize the "other," such as students of color and the need to address diversity, while disregarding exploration of the prevailing worldview of the dominant cultural group of white, middle-class individuals that most teacher training students identify with (cf. Gorski, 2008; Sleeter, 2017).

This absence of the CRT lens in teacher training can perhaps be understood against the backdrop of Dutch colonization and the historical denial of racism in the Netherlands in academia and public discourse (Esajas & de Abreu, 2019; Essed & Hoving, 2014; Wekker, 2017). Consequently, studying and discussing the impact and importance of racism has been highly contested in Dutch academia and policy (Essed & Hoving, 2014). However, due to several (inter)national emancipation movements regarding (Dutch) racism, including the controversies over the blackface figure Black Pete (Zwarte Piet)—central to the Dutch Saint Nicholas holiday tradition (van der Pijl & Goulordava, 2014), the Black Lives Matter Movement, public figures who openly speak out against racism, and the publication of several mainstream books addressing Dutch colonialism, racism, and white privilege, nowadays several teacher education institutions seek ways to include discussions about racism and other forms of oppression within their training program.

## 2. Present study

Given the recent developments and debates in Dutch society around racism and the increasing necessity within teacher training institutions in the Netherlands and elsewhere in Western-Europe to respond to these societal developments, this research aims to contribute to the knowledge gap around emotional responses of white teacher students during a CRT based course. An understanding of what emotional responses surface during the course can help teacher educators design courses that better suit the emotional needs of their students. This hopefully increases the chance of students developing knowledge and consciousness about racism. Our research is guided by the following research question: How do emotional responses arise among white Dutch teacher students during the CRT based course? We answered this question through analysis of the diaries student teachers wrote during a seven week compulsory CRT based course in the fourth year of their undergraduate program.

## 3. Method

We used a qualitative embedded comparative case study approach (Yin, 2009) to deeply explore the emotional responses of two white Dutch student teachers during a course based on Critical Race Theory. This approach allowed us to examine the emotions of each student as a unique case, within the same context. We analyzed both the weekly reports and diary entries to gain a comprehensive understanding of the emotional responses. Examining the diary entries, which is in essence a document analysis (cf. Bowen, 2009), provided a detailed and trustworthy account of the students' emotional state, allowing us to observe the emotions within the context and over time with more accuracy (Larkin & Jorgensen, 2016). Analysis of the diaries of these two students enabled us to confirm our findings (replication) and to identify diverging patterns of emotional responses across the diaries, thereby reaching more explanatory power.

### 3.1. Procedure and participants

After the course ended and the project had been approved by the Ethics Review Board of the Faculty of Social and Behavioral Sciences, University of Amsterdam, a total of 40 of 42 —11.9% male, 10% ethnic minority — students confirmed that their diaries could serve as data for this study. Because in this study we focus on the emotional responses of white student teachers, we excluded four diaries written by students who did not explicitly self-identify as white students (e.g., "Being a white woman, ..."). To get a first impression of the size and contents of the diaries, we read the diaries of the 36 white student teachers, each of them containing seven weeks of reflection, consisting of an average of 30 pages.

While reading the 36 diaries, we used memo-writing within Atlas.ti (Muhr, 2004). We wrote multiple memos regarding the richness and variety of the content of the 36 diaries in relation to Plutchik's (2001) 'wheel of emotions model'. To learn in-depth about how emotional responses arise among white Dutch student teachers during the CRT based course, we purposefully selected the diaries of two student teachers out of this group of 36. In the selection of the cases we considered a number factors that were important in light of the central research question (cf. Budiayanto et al., 2019; Simons, 2009). First, although all 36 students expressed emotions in their diaries, not all diaries were rich in detail (cf. de Oliveira Andreotti et al., 2014). Second, from the 24 diaries that were rich in detail, we looked for diaries that differed from each other in emotional responses to the course (what emotions they expressed, when and in relation to what course content). The diaries of two students matched our criteria. Besides being rich in detail, these students' diaries differed from each other in what emotions were expressed during the course, when and in relation to what course content. Therefore, selecting the diaries of these two students made it possible to take a closer look into the different ways in which white students emotionally respond during a CRT based course.

The first student, Petra (pseudonym) describes herself in her diary as a 21-year-old student teacher and anthropologist. She identifies as being white, heterosexual, and middle class. Petra grew up in an environment outside the city, an environment she typifies as safe, loving and joyful. She expresses not having dealt with racism or other forms of exclusion herself. Petra affirms not to have had long term friendships with people of color. Prior to enrollment on the program, she completed a bachelor's in social sciences and spent two years in a country in the Americas, working and studying anthropology-related courses. These former experiences, in her view, sensitized her to structural forms of exclusion and made her familiar with some of the concepts and content discussed during the course. Currently she lives with her boyfriend in the city where the university is located. Her boyfriend has no specific CRT related knowledge. Being an ambitious student, Petra is looking forward to teaching her own class as soon as possible.

Kim (pseudonym) describes herself in her diary as a 19-year-old female student teacher. She identifies as being white, heterosexual, raised in a middle class environment. Furthermore, Kim grew up in the south of the Netherlands. Consequently, in her view she speaks with an accent different from her peers. This makes her feel excluded sometimes. Since she started the teacher training program she has lived with her boyfriend in the city where the university is located. Her boyfriend has no CRT related knowledge, however, Kim affirms that he grew up in an ethnically more diverse context than she did herself. She started the teacher training course directly after high school. Although Kim does well in the teacher training program, she does not want to become a teacher after the program, but intends to continue as an educational expert.

### 3.2. Description of the course

The central question of this study is addressed by analyzing the diaries of two students participating within a mandatory course of a teacher training program in the Netherlands. This is a course in the

fourth year of an undergraduate program for becoming a primary teacher (for detailed description about teacher training programs in the Netherlands see Baan et al., 2020). The course contained content (e.g., book chapters, documentaries) that fit within the CRT-framework as understood by the course instructor (see Table 1 below). The learning goals of the course included the following:

### 3.3. The student...

- knows possible implications of whiteness, power structures, privilege, and racism in everyday lives of people;
- understands that a curriculum serves the interest of specific groups and influences identity development;
- knows the Dutch history of colonialism and slavery.

It was a 78-hour course including 14 contact hours in the form of seven seminars spread over an equal number of weeks. During the course, the student teachers worked on a diary. The diary is a file accessed via Google Drive which was configured so that only the lecturer and individual student could access. Each week the students answered guiding questions in this diary and reflected on assignments shared by the course instructor. Additionally, they reflected on questions related to their emotions and their thoughts, such as 'how do you feel when you read this?' and 'what does this mean for you and who you are?'. Completion of the diary was required for finalizing the course. Additionally, students worked on a final assignment: they translated parts of the course content into materials to be used in their own teaching practice (e.g., a child book, a nursery rhyme, a history lesson) or a workshop about race and racism. Both the diaries and the assessment were graded independently. The final grade of the course consisted of the average of both grades. The diaries were graded on three aspects: in-depth reflection on one's own thoughts and actions in relation to the materials (e.g., literature, web lectures, and documentaries), critically commenting on the presented materials, and level of openness in the reflection. A week-to-week overview of the course is presented in Table 1.

### 3.4. Data analysis

First, to ensure confidentiality, the names of the student teachers were removed. Then, the diaries were imported in Atlas.ti. This with the aim to store, organize, and manage the data.

Second, in Atlas.ti codes were created based on Plutchik's (2001) classifications of emotions, which is an example of directed content analysis (Hsieh & Shannon, 2005). This approach allowed us to use a pre-existing framework (i.e. Plutchik's, 2001 classifications) to guide our analysis and to ensure that we were capturing the specific emotions of interest. Thereby, using the 'comment' tool in Atlas.ti, we operationalized the emotions on the basis of a description of observable phenomena (indicators) with examples. For example, the emotion 'interest' was operationalized as 'Students ask research or conceptual questions and indicate that they would like to see them answered and/or students explicitly express enthusiasm for the material with statements like "[source] was very interesting to me", "I like [source]", and "I wonder how...". After going back and forth through the diaries, the emotion code book was created (for an overview of the emotions and their operationalization see the codebook including operationalizations of the emotions in Table 2).

During the entire process, to ensure internal validity, we continued to use memo-writing as a tool (cf. van der Goot et al., 2012). We wrote multiple memos within Atlas.ti which were stored by name, date, and number. In this way, we were able to detect research biases and regenerate data collection and analyses. Additionally, several discussion meetings were held to assure that the codes were interpreted and used in a similar way (cf. Bowen, 2008).

The central question we address in this study is: How do emotional

responses arise among white Dutch teacher students during the CRT based course?

To answer the research question, first the diaries of Petra and Kim were read in detail and coded by the three of us independently. We selected sentences where students expressed emotions according to our operationalization and coded using the emotions codebook. After each of us coded the two diaries independently, we compared the selected sentences and the codes we assigned to these parts of the text. In a few situations, the selection by one of us contained more sentences and/or more or other emotions were assigned to the selections of the text. When this happened, we had a closer look at that part of the diary together, discussing our interpretation of the text at the level of words, phrases and sentences (cf. Chatterjee et al., 2019) and exchanged our arguments on why we selected certain sentences and/or coded a selection of the text with certain emotions. In most situations this was enough to come to a collective interpretation of the data. We then resized the selection of the text as agreed and/or assigned different emotions to the selected text. In a few cases, based on our exchange as researchers, we additionally decided to adjust the operationalization of an emotion. For example, we first operationalized acceptance as '*Tolerating negative feelings about prejudice/racism and/or other exclusionary mechanisms by not trying to change or suppress them*', however we later observed that acceptance was also an active way of recognizing and acknowledging certain structures and /or patterns of racism and other exclusion mechanisms. Hence, we adjusted the operationalization to '*Students indicate that they recognize and acknowledge certain structures and/or patterns of racism and other exclusion mechanisms (of themselves and/or in society). Use words like "naturally" and "always".'*. After adjustments were made, we went through both diaries again together to make sure that the refined operationalization of some emotions still matched the other quotes these emotions were assigned to. The final results in terms of emotional responses the white teacher students show in their diaries during the CRT based course are presented in Table 3 which we present in the results section. There we also give some examples of quotes to illustrate our findings.

Next, we took an inductive approach to the diaries in order to analyze how students were responding to or reflecting on certain content at the moment of expressing the emotional response. Specifically, we now looked at larger sections of the text around the selected sentences which we earlier identified as emotional responses, resulting in an additional understanding of how emotional responses arise amongst these white teacher students during the CRT based course. We made memos in Atlas-ti on what we observed regarding how students reacted or reflected on certain content at the time they expressed the emotional response. These memos were discussed until consensus was reached.

Finally, we shared a first draft of the results paragraph with Kim and Petra to further assure the trustworthiness of our analysis. We specifically asked them whether they recognized themselves in the emotional responses we identified in their diaries. Both students affirmed to recognize themselves in the analysis, at the same time expressing feeling confronted by what they read about their own experiences.

## 4. Results

As illustrated in Table 3 below, in our exploration we observed that the emotional responses in Petra's and Kim's diaries covered 16 of the 32 emotions. Of these emotions, 13 were identified in both students' diaries. The emotions of *anger* and *surprise* were only identified in Petra's diary while the emotion *annoyance* was only identified in Kim's diary. When identifying which emotions occurred in which week, we observed that in Petra's diary the emotions interest (week 2–6), disapproval (week 1, 2, 4, 6, and 7), joy (week 2–6), and pensiveness (week 2–6) occurred most. And in Kim's diary grief (week 2, 3, 4, and 6), apprehension (week 1, 2, 4, and 6), interest (week 3, 4, 6, and 7) and acceptance (week 1, 3, 4, and 6) were frequently observed. Moreover, we noted in both students' diaries that the number of emotions

**Table 1**  
Course Overview.

Week	Theme	Description
1	The case	<p>Prior to the first seminar and first readings, the following “case” is introduced to the students: A teacher colleague told you the following during the break: “Yesterday, we were discussing the terms prejudice and stereotypes. We kept it mild because of their age (10, 11 years), nevertheless it seemed that they were extremely negative toward Africans/Blacks. They were teasing each other with African names and called the African children ‘bokoe’. Guiding and reflective questions for the diary are:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. How would you respond professionally as a teacher and how would you respond personally?</li> <li>2. When you respond, in what way does your personal identity influence your reaction?</li> <li>3. What tools would you use?</li> </ol> <p>Students watch an online lecture ‘Why can’t America think straight about race, even with a black president?’ (Jhally, 2010) and read two articles about racism within the Dutch context, the article ‘Elite discourse and racism’ by van Dijk (1987) and the tekst ‘From ethnic minorities to ethnic majority policy: Multiculturalism and the shift to assimilationism in the Netherlands.’ by Vasta (2007).</p>
2	Enlightened racism	<p>Guiding and reflective questions for the diary are:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Explain the meaning of enlightened racism</li> <li>2. Describe how you recognize enlightened racism in your daily life.</li> <li>3. Give examples from your own life that illustrates the relation between elites and racist discourse</li> <li>4. How did you experience the article by Vasta?</li> </ol> <p>Students watch the documentary ‘Zwart als roet’ [Our Colonial Hangover] by Bergmen (2014) and read the article ‘Amygdala sensitivity to race is not present in childhood but emerges over adolescence’ by Telzer et al. (2013).</p>
3	White privilege I	<p>Guiding and reflective questions for the diary are:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. What reactions does Bergman’s documentary evoke in you?</li> <li>2. Link the opening of the article by Telzer et al. (2013) to the concept of “enlightened racism” Sut Jhally discusses in his web lecture (viewed in week two)</li> </ol> <p>Students complete a Dutch version of the Implicit Association Test (IAT: <a href="https://www.onderhuids.nl/">https://www.onderhuids.nl/</a>). Afterwards, students watch the documentary ‘White Like Me. Race, Racism, &amp; White Privilege in America’ (Wise, 2013). Finally they read Spanierman and Cabreras’ ‘The Emotions of White Racism and Antiracism.’ (2015).</p>
4	White privilege II	<p>Guiding and reflective questions for the diary are:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. After completing IAT: Look at your preference for a particular skin color. What does the result mean for you as a person and your acting as a teacher?</li> <li>2. Reflect on what it takes to overcome your preference for a particular skin color, if the Test shows any.</li> <li>3. How would you place yourself in the ‘Taxonomy from white apathy to white anti-racism’ developed by Spanierman and Cabrera (2015)?</li> </ol> <p>Students watch an online lecture ‘Why images matter’ (Jhally, 2013), read two book chapters from ‘White on Black: Images of Africa and Blacks in Western Popular Culture’ (Pieterse, 1992).</p>
5	Power, Images, and Identity	<p>Guiding and reflective questions for the diary are:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. What are your experiences with images and stories that are represented in our culture about people who look like you?</li> <li>2. Link the content of the chapters by Pieterse (1992) to a statement made by the Dutch comedian Freek de Jonge: “the emancipation of minority groups has made our work as comedians more difficult.”</li> </ol> <p>Students watch an online lecture ‘Historical Perspectives’ (Grosfoguel, 2013) and read the article ‘E-Racing slavery: Racial Neoliberalism, Social Forgetting, and Scientific Colonialism in Dutch Primary School History Textbooks’ by Weiner (2014). For reflection in their diaries, the following assignment was shared with the students:</p>
6	Decolonial Theories	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Have a look at the history method book used at your internship school. To what extent do you recognize the results of Weiner’s study?</li> </ol>
7	Rewriting the case	<p>Students are asked to rethink their reflections on the case as they wrote down in the first week and rewrite their answer if they feel that they had a new point of view.</p>

identified differed per week. At the same time, it became visible that it is not in the same weeks that students expressed more or less emotions. For example, while in Petra’s diary of week 5 five emotions became apparent, we did not identify any emotion in Kim’s diary that week. Finally, most emotions were already identified in the first two weeks of the course.

## 5. Week one

In the first week of the course students were asked how they would respond as a teacher and personally to the presented case (see Table 1) and how their reaction is influenced by their personal identity. Also students were asked what tools they could use to address the case. Own personal experiences and prior knowledge (for example from former studies) were the only sources students could build on in their responses, as students did not study critical race related material for this course yet. Below we present our analysis of both students’ diaries of this first week.

### 5.1. Petra

First we observed that Petra expressed *amazement* and *disapproval* when she reflected on the case, specifically the behavior of the teacher in the case. Petra expressed these emotions with regard to what happened in the presented case and states that she would be shocked if she got to know that in the class of a colleague there was room for children to berate each other like this based on their race and/ or skin color.

Right after, when responding to the first question formulated by the course instructor (*How would you respond as a teacher and personally to the presented case?*), Petra elaborated on the way she would herself approach such a case. Expressing the emotion of *anticipation* she emphasized the importance of teachers “uncovering where comments like the one presented in the case come from”, including studying history and reflecting on the question of who writes history. She expressed her belief that this would be necessary in order to make children reflect on “*what they say, why, and with what effect*”.

Last, we found that Petra expressed the emotion of *acceptance* when she responded to the second question (*When you respond, in what way does your personal identity influence your reaction?*). She wrote:

*“My identity plays a role of course, like it always does. Identity is rather a static concept, however I do have a certain background that plays a role and being a white girl who grew up in luxury without any worries could make me a racist and a xenophobe. But I am not, and that is because of my upbringing and because of the fact that I am an Anthropologist.”*

#### 5.1.1. Kim

We identified the emotions *acceptance*, *apprehension*, and *anticipation* when, in the opening of her diary, Kim responded to the first question formulated by the course instructor (*How would you respond as a teacher and personally to the presented case?*) and reflected on her own professional role and actions in a situation like the one presented in the case. She expressed not knowing how to react in such a situation. We

**Table 2**  
Emotion codebook.

Code	Operationalization	Example
Acceptance	Students indicate that they recognize and acknowledge certain structures and/or patterns of racism and other exclusion mechanisms (of themselves and/or in society). Use words like "naturally" and "always".	"My identity plays a role, of course always. Identity is a somewhat static concept, but I do have a whole background that plays a role." (S3)
Admiration	Students express their high appreciation of something.	-
Aggressiveness	Students express themselves violently with the aim of inflicting physical or emotional harm on someone or something.	-
Amazement	Students indicate that they find certain aspects of reality strange. They are shocked in a negative sense after processing a new critical view on reality. Use words like "shock" or "amazed".	"Insights from the documentary indicate the subjectivity of everything and how everything is interpreted differently by everyone. The girls who participate in the clips and misogyny also see this as something very different: sex sells. But also that people are less sensitive to sexism these days. And I found it very shocking to see how those hip-hop artists reacted when they were approached about the fact that it is actually so paradoxical what they sing and how it actually is. maintain racism. They didn't have an answer for this, but they seemed to know." (S3)
Anger	Students express to strongly disagree, and to be uncomfortable with a perceived situation of racism or other forms of structural exclusion. Use words like anger.	"I go along with his 'anger' that he expresses in the last part of the lecture, that almost nothing has really changed. Like the US invaded countries to force democracy, it's just the same as 400–500 years ago."(S4)
Annoyance	Students indicate that they are annoyed by a certain approach or social reality. Use sentences such as "I don't like this..." or "I'm not comfortable with this...".	"People often talk after me like I'm some kind of idiot and I don't like that." (S4)
Anticipation	Students articulate a mission or strategy that they use or want to apply in the future to battle forms of social exclusion. Sentences include, for instance, "I will try to..." "I can imagine that..." or "I would like...".	"So if this incident were to occur in the classroom, I would probably initially ask why they are using the word..." (S4)
Apprehension	Students express fear or uncertainty about their (anti-)racist thinking and practices. Sentences include "I'm afraid to." "I find it difficult." "I don't know very well."	"This is exactly what I have to think about when I read this article. How am I going to convey this? What am I going to tell in the extra lessons I give for this theme? And what do my school think, the other teachers? Principal? The parents!? I'm afraid to come forward very strongly here."(S3)
Awe	Students express feelings of appreciation and admiration for something.	-
Boredom	Students express feelings of listlessness, of not being interested/disinterested.	-
Contempt	Students indicate that they look down on something or find something inferior.	-
Disgust	Students indicate that they have an aversion to something.	-
Disapproval	Students indicate that they disagree with a certain approach or social reality and/or give a negative opinion about this. Sentences consist of "I have trouble with." or "I disagree with."	"I think the taxonomy is a bit black and white and I also have a problem with the lack of attention to the individual and I wonder whether this way of talking about race contributes to the fight against racism, but that's another story." (S3)
Distraction	Student does something to temporarily take his/ her attention away from a strong emotion.	-
Ecstasy	Students express themselves outside themselves through delight.	-
Fear	Students express themselves in an oppressive, unpleasant emotional state caused by threat/danger.	-
Grief	Students report feeling sad or gloomy about aspects of social reality and finding it difficult to digest those aspects emotionally. Example sentences are "I find these realities difficult..." or "It's painful to see..."	"It is painful to see that the white privilege is denied at the NPO/VPRO [Dutch public broadcasters]". (S4)
Interest	Students ask research or conceptual questions and indicate that they would like to see them answered and/or the students explicitly express enthusiasm for the material with statements like "[source] was very interesting to me", "I like [source]", and "I wonder how...".	"Sut Jhally, I had actually never heard of him. He makes very nice points. In principle it is completely in line with my own way of thinking and what he says is not new to me either. He paints a clear picture of racism in the US and goes deep into it. I like that he puts so much emphasis on discourse (and how that's also reinforced by the media) and how that perpetuates racism and also class." (S3)
Joy	Students show a sense of fun and happiness regarding the critical view on reality. They add smileys/exclamation marks to sentences in their text. Examples of expressions of joy are 'this author makes very nice points.', 'that was fun', 'I like this', 'I enjoyed it'.	White Empathy: teacher you need to Take Care of this! Only then can I reach the anti-racist stage. (No, just kidding. Of course I have to do that myself)." (S4)
Loathing	Students express the feeling that they find something very repulsive.	-
Love	Students express feelings of warm affection, a sense of devotion to something or someone else.	-
Optimism	Students indicate that their own development or that of society is going 'in the right direction' when it comes to racism or other forms of exclusion. There is hope.	"This is a positive insight for me and gives hope to the extent to which we can change the racist aspects of our society!" (S3)
Pensiveness	Students indicate that they are still working out things, do not have definitive answers but, instead, still have questions about social reality and forms of exclusion. Example sentences are "I don't have made my mind up..." or "I am still working out".	"Continuously when I read this I think, okay it is true that the Dutch discriminate and are racist. I also see this in my daily life. But what should we do about this? What should I do with this as a teacher? What should I do with this as a student? I do not know. I can't change it on my own. I don't know what to do with this knowledge. I don't belong to the elite who can do something about it now. Or do we follow this course so that if we ever get in a position to change something about it, we will? Or should I just be aware of it? I don't really know what that will bring. And if the system is wrong and encourages racism, what am I supposed to do with that fact? What are we supposed to do with that data? Hope it changes slowly by making students aware of this?"(S4)
Rage	Students express feelings of intense anger and a strong urge to do something about it.	-
Remorse	Students express feelings of guilt and shame in combination with a certain impotence regarding their own role in counteracting social inequalities. Use, for instance, the word "unfortunately".	"We believe this when in fact it is not the case. This research shows that very clearly. We unconsciously react differently to people of different origins. I

(continued on next page)

Table 2 (continued)

Code	Operationalization	Example
Sadness	Students express aspects of mourning and disappointment.	don't really know how to respond to this. I recognize it in myself, unfortunately. " (S4)
Serenity	Students show that they have already thought about something more and that they are clear and emotionally calm. This goes hand in hand with sentences such as "there is no one to blame for" or "it is what it is".	"But the real beauty of both is, and it shouldn't be overlooked, that there's really no one to blame anymore for having internalized it and that's structural and very hard to do anything about. You can't blame someone for how they were raised, only how they eventually deal with it as an adult." (S3)
Submission	Students express themselves fully by submitting to something or someone.	-
Surprise	Students are surprised positively regarding new insights about aspects of social reality as they expected something different. This is reflected in words like "positive" or "this was new for me".	"However, I expected that I might have a slight preference for white people because of my background, but maybe because I have also lived in South America and in Southeast I was able to neutralize myself well. This is a positive insight for me. (S3)
Terror	Students express that a specific event or situation is the worst thing that can happen.	-
Trust	Students express that they believe that development towards anti-racist education and an anti-racist society is possible. Use words such as "change" or "possible" in relation to the long term.	"These are changes that we will have to pull across the generations and I think we as educators can play an important role in this. And as parents who pass it on to their children. More inter-ethnic friendships and mixed schools, anyway, that's my vision."(S3)
Vigilance	Students indicate that they are alert and ready to intervene.	-

Note: emotions derived from the work of Plutchik (2001)

identified the emotions of *apprehension* and *acceptance* when Kim reflected on the second question (*When you respond, in what way does your personal identity influence your reaction?*). She expressed that, based on her own personal experiences and background she would *not know* how to act in such a case. She wrote: *"The role of my identity in this is probably that I am ignorant. I don't know what it is like to be scolded for this. And I don't know how I would want my teacher to react if I were in the shoes of the abused child."*

In a similar way we found that Kim expressed the emotion of *acceptance* when she reflected on the question of what tools she would use to act in a similar situation as presented in the case (the third question formulated by the course instructor). She affirmed that the only tool she has being *"a white Dutch person"*, are her *"Surinamese colleagues"*. She wrote: *"Perhaps they can explain what it means to someone when you use this word [bokoe]. Because I can't do it myself yet."*

## 6. Week two

The focus in the second week of the course is on the concept of enlightened racism. Students watched the online lecture 'Why can't America think straight about race, even with a black president?' (Jhally,

2010). The goal of this lecture was introducing students to the concepts of race, racism, and enlightened racism. After watching the lecture students were asked to explain the meaning of enlightened racism in their diaries and describe how they recognize enlightened racism in their daily lives (see course overview in Table 1). Students also read two articles about racism within the Dutch context (van Dijk, 1987 and Vasta, 2007). Van Dijk discusses the discursive power elites hold on ordinary citizens. Vasta critiques the Dutch for claiming to be tolerant and liberal on the one hand and denying racism on the other hand. This critical perspective on Dutch society was used as provocative stimuli to discuss the concepts of race, racism, and enlightened racism in students' personal life history. In their diaries students were asked to give examples from their own lives that illustrate the relation between elites and racist discourse. Finally, they were asked how they experienced the article by Vasta.

### 6.1. Petra

In Petra's second week's diary we first identified the emotion of *interest* when, on her own initiative, she critically reflected on the lecture by Sut Jhally and compared the content of the lecture with her prior

Table 3

Emotions identified in diaries Petra and Kim week 1–7.

	week 1	week 2	week 3	week 4	week 5	week 6	week 7
Petra		Acceptance, Anticipation, Disapproval, <b>Grief</b> , <b>Interest</b> , <b>Joy</b> , <b>Optimism</b> , <b>Pensiveness</b> , <b>Serenity</b> , <b>Trust</b>	Amazement, Interest, Joy, Pensiveness, Serenity	Acceptance, Anticipation, Disapproval, Interest, Joy, Optimism, Pensiveness, <b>Remorse</b> , <b>Surprise</b>	Acceptance, Interest, Joy, Pensiveness, Serenity	<b>Anger</b> , <b>Apprehension</b> , Disapproval, Grief, Interest, Joy, Pensiveness	Anticipation, Disapproval, Serenity, Trust
Kim	Acceptance, Anticipation, <b>Apprehension</b>	<b>Amazement</b> , <b>Annoyance</b> , Apprehension, <b>Disapproval</b> , <b>Grief</b> , <b>Pensiveness</b> , <b>Remorse</b>	Acceptance, Annoyance, Disapproval, Grief, <b>Interest</b> , <b>Optimism</b> , Pensiveness, Remorse	Acceptance, Amazement, Anticipation, Apprehension, Disapproval, Grief, Interest, Joy, Optimism, Pensiveness	(none)	Acceptance, Apprehension, Grief, Interest	Anticipation, Interest, Joy, Optimism, <b>Serenity</b> , <b>Trust</b>

Note: text in bold indicates that in that week the emotion was identified for the first time in the diary of the student; emotions reported only once each week, also if identified more often



knowledge. Then, when Petra reflected on the concept discourse (a concept used by Sut Jhally) a mixture of *grief*, *acceptance*, *optimism*, and *trust* was observed. Petra expressed the emotion of *grief* when she reflected on the role of discourse in structures of oppression in current society, after which she showed emotions of *acceptance*, *optimism*, and *trust* when she expressed to believe that the long term change of these structures is possible. Thereby, amongst others, she reflected on the role of teachers like herself in this process.

Later on, when Petra reflected on the first two questions shared by the course instructor (*Explain the meaning of enlightened racism and Describe how you recognize enlightened racism in your daily life*) and the concept of discourse, we identified the emotions of *acceptance* and *anticipation*. Expressing acceptance she described how media, and specifically propaganda, affects her thinking and acting too and she anticipated on how she tries to minimize this influence currently and in the future. She wrote:

*"[] in my own life. I also notice that media and discourse have an effect on me. I sometimes discover thoughts or behaviors in myself that I know are probably caused by media influences. I reflect on this a lot and never act on it, because my brain is more critical and my feeling is just conditioned. That is why I also look for places to educate myself and eventually get rid of that influence of media."*

Subsequently in this second week's diary, when Petra reflected on van Dijk's work, and specifically the way the author uses the concepts 'racism' and 'elites', we observed the emotion *pensiveness*. She compared the two concepts with her own understanding of the concept 'institutional racism' and, as if she thought out loud, formulated several questions, for example regarding the role of 'elites' in the structural character of racism.

We observed the emotions of *disapproval*, *interest*, and *serenity* when Petra reflected on the second question shared by the course instructor (*Give examples from your own life that illustrate the relation between elites and racist discourse*). When she referred to the role of media and education, we identified *interest* and *serenity* when she showed familiarity with reflections on this issue.

Besides, we identified the emotion of *joy* when Petra expressed to value the fact that van Dijk in his article pays attention to the idea that identities are dynamic. And, finally, we noticed Petra expressed the emotions of *interest* and *joy* when reflecting on and critically evaluating the analysis of the Dutch context regarding racism presented by Vasta.

#### 6.1.1. Kim

In the opening of her diary of week two Kim expressed the emotions of *apprehension* and *pensiveness* when she reflected on the context she worked in and questions she had about her own working context and the children she teaches.

Later on we identified the emotions of *annoyance*, *apprehension*, and *remorse* when Kim reflected on the course in a broader sense. She expressed to feel annoyed by the, in her view, covert goal of the course to make students "feel white" and expressed at the same time apprehension with regards to the emotions of remorse the course evokes in her. She wrote:

*"P.S. I kind of get the feeling that this is a 'feel how white you are' course. And that I should feel very guilty and bad about the fact that I act white (if that is the case). But just because I am ashamed of inequalities doesn't make the inequalities disappear. I don't think I can really do anything with it."*

It called to our attention that, when Kim subsequently explicitly addressed the first two questions (*Explain the meaning of enlightened racism and Describe how you recognize enlightened racism in your daily life*), she seemed to kind of emotionally 'close off', being very brief in her answers.

Later in her diary of this week, we observed Kim again expressing more emotions when she reflected on the first two questions shared by

the course instructor (*Explain the meaning of enlightened racism and Describe how you recognize enlightened racism in your daily life*). We identified the emotions of *disapproval* and *grief* when she shared reflections on daily observations of enlightened racism outside her intimate sphere, like for example in interactions between white Dutch people and people with other ethnic backgrounds in shops.

Later in week 2, when she responds to the fourth question and reflects on the work of Vasta (*How do you experience the article by Vasta?*), the emotions of *apprehension* and *pensiveness* were identified. *Apprehension* was found in the first part of the next citation and *pensiveness* in the second part:

*"Every time I read this I think, okay it is true that the Dutch discriminate and that they are racist. I also see this in my daily life. But what are we supposed to do against this? What should I do with this as a teacher? What should I do with this as a student at the teacher training course? I do not know. I can't change it on my own. I don't know what to do with this knowledge."*

Right after we found Kim comparing Vasta's observations with her own experiences of discrimination she experienced as a person with an accent from the southern region of the Netherlands. Thereby, we identified her expressing the emotions of *annoyance* and *disapproval* where it concerned her experience of people 'othering' her because of her accent.

After, Kim continued to freely share some reflections on her own thoughts and behaviors where it concerns racism and discrimination. This went hand in hand with the emotions of *amazement*, *pensiveness*, and *annoyance*.

## 7. Week three

In week three students watched the documentary 'Zwart als roet' (Our Colonial Hangover) (Bergman, 2014). This documentary is best described as a personal quest around the debate about 'Black Pete', the black-faced helper of Santa Claus [Sinterklaas] and the denial of the existence of racism in the Netherlands. This documentary was accompanied by an article about the role of the amygdala in relation to racism (Telzer et al., 2013). Guiding and reflective questions for the diaries were: 'What reactions does Sunny Bergman's documentary 'Our Colonial Hangover' evoke in you?' and 'Link the opening of the article by Telzer et al. (2013) to the concept of "enlightened racism" Sut Jhally discusses in his web lecture (viewed in week two)'. Petra communicated with the course instructor that she already knew the documentary 'Zwart als roet' and had previously reflected on the phenomenon 'Black Pete' in academic papers and discussions. Therefore, the course instructor proposed that she instead watch the documentary 'Hip-Hop Beyond Beats & Rhymes' (Hurt, 2006), a documentary that expresses the complex intersection between hip-hop, racism, sexism, and homophobia. Petra was invited to freely reflect on this source in her diary.

### 7.1. Petra

In her third week diary we observed how Petra openly shared her thoughts on the documentary 'Hip-Hop Beyond Beats & Rhymes'. We observed her expressing *joy* concerning the fact that she could watch this documentary. Besides, we identified the emotion of *interest* when she thereafter shared what she specifically valued in the documentary. We also identified Petra expressing the emotions of *interest*, *amazement*, and *joy* when she explained what new insights the documentary gave her, for example concerning the concepts of homophobia and eroticism.

Moreover, we observed the emotion of *interest* when Petra linked the new insights the watching of the documentary gave her to knowledge she already had from her former studies. The emotions of *interest* and *joy* were also observed when Petra on her own initiative linked insights, which she distilled out of the course content of week 2, to the analysis presented in the documentary.

We identified the emotion of *interest* when Petra shared questions she

developed after watching the documentary regarding the origins of stereotype images of black people. The emotions of *interest* and *serenity* were observed when Petra freely reflected on Telzer et al. The emotion of *interest* was observed, for example when Petra reflected on the analysis about how the amygdala seems to work. We observed the emotion of *serenity* in the way Petra reflected on the issue of guilt and blame where it considered structural racism. She wrote:

*“However, the real fine point of both [Telzer et al., and Jhally] is, and this should not be overlooked, that it is actually no one’s fault because they internalized it [racism] and that it is structural and very difficult to do something about. You can’t blame someone for how they were raised, just only for how they eventually cope with it as an adult.”*

Finally, we identified the emotion of *interest* when Petra on her own initiative referred to insights she obtained by reading specific sections in Telzer et al. This emotion was accompanied by the emotion of *pensiveness* when she reflected on and expressed doubt or questioned certain ideas presented in the article.

#### 7.1.1. Kim

In this third week, first we observed Kim expressing the emotions of *annoyance* and *disapproval* when she, responding the first question formulated by the course instructor, reflected on the social reality presented in the documentary by Bergman, specifically some utterances shown by people who defend the existence of the Black Pete figure. Still reflecting on the social reality presented in the documentary, we also observed the emotion of *optimism* in the diary of Kim when she compared the presentation of social reality in the documentary with her own observations in society.

Moreover, we identified the emotion of *disapproval* when Kim referred to the persons portrayed in the documentary who still defend the character Black Pete and the emotions of *disapproval* and *grief* when she reacted to the fact that the Dutch national public broadcast channel still denies the existence of white privilege.

Kim expressed the emotion of *interest* when reflecting on why the documentary producer shows the reactions of Londoners when they are confronted with the Black Pete figure. Kim, on her own initiative, also reflected on her own ideas and biases around the Black Pete figure and racism. Here we observed that Kim expressed *acceptance* when she affirmed to recognize her own biases and reflected on how this influenced her thinking and acting in present and past. Moreover we identified the emotion of *grief* when Kim expressed her belief that she cannot change these biases. She wrote:

*“I haven’t taken the white person bias test myself, but I know for myself that I probably prefer white people. I don’t have to take the test in order to know it. I hope the fact that I am aware of this can ensure that I can make choices even more consciously in this area. Unfortunately, I cannot influence my subconscious preference.”*

Also we identified the emotions of *acceptance*, *disapproval*, and *pensiveness* when Kim, after reading Telzer et al., on her own initiative reflected on enlightened racism in own thinking and acting. When linking one sentence in the text by Telzer et al. concerning inequality (*‘... the belief that everyone is equal and should have the same rights and opportunities.’*) to her own observations of social reality and her own thinking and acting, we identified the emotions of *acceptance*, *disapproval*, *grief*, and *remorse*. She expressed the emotion of *acceptance* when she affirmed to agree with the conclusions presented by Telzer et al. that even when this is a widespread belief, reality shows that people do not have the same rights and opportunities. Then she expressed *disapproval* and *remorse* when she gave examples of this from her own observations. Finally, she expressed the emotion of *grief* when she affirmed to recognize the conclusion drawn by Telzer et al. in her own non-verbal reactions.

Last, when Kim, on her own initiative, wrote that she started to talk about the topics addressed in Telzer et al. with her boyfriend we observed the emotions of *pensiveness* and *acceptance*.

## 8. Week four

In week four the concept of white privilege is elaborated further on. Now students are invited to reflect on what white privilege means in their own lives. First the students completed a Dutch version of the Implicit Association Test (IAT: <https://www.onderhuids.nl/>). Afterwards, students watched the documentary ‘White Like Me’ (Wise, 2013), a personal examination of how racial privilege shapes the lives of white Americans. This documentary was accompanied by the reading of Spanierman and Cabrer’s article *The Emotions of White Racism and Antiracism*. (2015) in which they present the taxonomy ‘From white apathy to white anti-racism’. Guiding and reflective questions for the diaries in this fourth week related to the IAT and the taxonomy: ‘After completing IAT: Look at your preference for a particular skin color. What does the result mean for you as a person and your acting as a teacher?’; ‘Reflect on what it takes to overcome your preference for a particular skin color, if the Test shows any’, and ‘How would you place yourself in the ‘Taxonomy from white apathy to white anti-racism’ developed by Spanierman and Cabrera (2015)’?

### 8.1. Petra

In the opening of this fourth week diary of Petra, we identified the emotions of *acceptance*, *surprise*, and *optimism*. These emotions were identified when Petra, invited by the first question, formulated by the course instructor (*After completing the Implicit Association Test: Look at your preference for a particular skin color. What does the result mean for you as a person and your acting as a teacher?*), reflected on the outcome of the IAT she completed. Petra explained:

*“Your outcome indicates that you don’t have a preference for light-skinned or dark-skinned people.” I think this is definitely in line with how I behave in my life and especially in the classroom and how I feel about it. However, I expected that I might have a slight preference for white people because of my background. Perhaps because I lived in South America and in South-East I was able to neutralize myself. This is a positive insight for me and provides hope to what extent we can change internalized culture (and racism)!”*

Right after, still responding to the first question formulated by the course instructor, we observed Petra expressing the emotions of *interest*, *acceptance*, and *anticipation* when she wrote about the other variants of the IAT such as bias against people from Arabic descent.

Petra concluded her reflections on the outcome of the IAT and the first question formulated by the course instructor by expressing *anticipation* and *optimism* when she explained that, in order to continue working on eliminating her own biases in the future, she will visit countries with cultures she is not yet very familiar with.

Petra extensively reflected on the thoughts and feelings triggered in her when watching the documentary ‘White Like Me’. Here we noticed the emotions of *interest* and *joy* in relation to how the documentary producer shows US reality and the focus on institutional racism and white privilege.

Besides, on some points, we also identified the emotion of *disapproval* regarding the social reality in the US shown in the documentary. We observed the emotion of *acceptance* when she referred to the idea expressed in the documentary that racism is internalized. And, finally we identified the emotion of *optimism* when she agreed with the idea that, even when racism is internalized in everyone, we can all condition ourselves to at least not act racist.

When Petra continues to reflect on the documentary ‘White Like Me’ we identified the emotions of *interest* and *pensiveness*. We identified these emotions when Petra reflected on the new insights the documentary provided her on the one hand and the new questions that arose as a result on the other hand. For example, the question “whether all white people are able to become conscious about their white privilege?”.

Later in this diary Petra expressed more clearly the emotion of

*disapproval* regarding the point made in the documentary about the need of everybody to become color conscious and categorizing people as black or white. However, later we also identified Petra expressing the emotions of *interest* and *joy* when she freely reflected on how reference is made in the documentary to the role of education in the struggle against racism.

Then, when Petra reflected on how she would rate herself in the 'Taxonomy from white apathy to white anti-racism' (the third question formulated by the course instructor), we noticed that the emotions she expressed (*disapproval* and *pensiveness*) were not related to rating herself in the taxonomy, but to her evaluation of the taxonomy as an analytical instrument and the use of certain words. Specifically the use of the distinction between 'black' and 'white' and, in her view, lack of regard for the individual when using such categorization.

Concluding her diary of week four, Petra explicitly answered the third question formulated by the course instructor (*How would you place yourself in the 'Taxonomy from white apathy to white anti-racism' developed by Spanierman and Cabrera (2015)*). She explains how and why she scored herself in the categories 'White guilt and shame', 'White empathy' and 'Emotions of white antiracism'. In the beginning of her answer, when discussing the category 'White guilt and shame' she expressed to understand how she also contributes to the continuation of racism, we identified the emotions of *acceptance* and *remorse*. Besides, we identified the emotions of *acceptance*, *anticipation*, and *optimism* when she discussed why she scored herself on the scales 'White empathy' and 'Emotions of white antiracism'.

#### 8.1.1. Kim

In Kim's diary of week 4 we identified various emotions related to the outcome of the IAT in combination with the first question formulated by the course instructor (*After completing the IAT: look at your preference for a certain skin color. What does the result mean for you as a person and your acting as a teacher?*). In the next quote we identified the emotion of *acceptance* when she expressed the outcome (that confirms she has a bias in favor of white people) to correspond with what she expected and the emotion of *apprehension* when she wrote that the outcome of the IAT is stronger than she expected and she does not know how to overcome this bias:

"The test showed that I have a strong preference for white people. I expected that I would have a preference for white people anyway, but I hoped it wouldn't be so extreme. I don't really know what to do with it. All I can do with it is to be aware of it and try not to express my unconscious preference to students."

On the other side we identified the emotions of *pensiveness* and *anticipation* when Kim further reflected on the outcome of the IAT and, specifically, on the question of what it takes to overcome the preference for a particular skin color (the second question formulated by the course instructor). While Kim expresses not having any idea of how to overcome and eliminate her biases, she did express that in the future she can try to be more conscious about her bias and try not to show her bias to her pupils.

In the second part of this week's diary, Kim in a few words reflected on the documentary 'White Like Me' we identified the emotions of *amazement* and *pensiveness* when she expresses to be shocked by what she learned about racism in the US context and expressed to wonder how racism looks like in the Netherlands.

Then responding to the third question formulated by the course instructor (*How would you place yourself in the 'Taxonomy from white apathy to white anti-racism' developed by Spanierman and Cabrera (2015)?*), we observed Kim expressing the emotion of *acceptance* throughout the entire reflection. We identified the emotions of *joy*, *disapproval*, *anticipation*, *optimism*, *grief*, and *interest* when she wrote about each of the categories in the taxonomy reflecting on how she recognizes elements of it in people around her and in her own thinking and acting.

## 9. Week five

In the fifth week of the course the focus was on the concepts of representation and stereotyping. In preparation for the fifth session students watched an online lecture 'Why images matter' (Jhally, 2013). This lecture poses questions like: 'who creates the images in mainstream media? Which images do we see and which images we do not see?' Furthermore, in the lecture the role of advertisers in popular culture is examined by explaining the concept of hyper ritualization. After watching the lecture, students read two book chapters from 'White on Black: Images of Africa and Blacks in Western Popular Culture' (Pieterse, 1990). This book discusses stereotype representations of black people in Europe and America from the late 18th century onward. The first guiding and reflective question for the diary is: 'What are your experiences with images and stories that are represented in our culture about people who look like you?' Secondly, the students were asked to link the content of the chapters by Pieterse (1992) to a statement made by a Dutch comedian: "*the emancipation of minority groups has made our work as comedians more difficult.*"

### 9.1. Petra

In her diary of week five we first identified the emotions of *interest*, *joy*, *acceptance*, and *serenity* when Petra reflects on the first question formulated by the course instructor (*What are your experiences with images and stories that are represented in our culture about people who look like you?*). The next quote illustrates how Petra expressed that both the web lecture, but even more the first question formulated by the course instructor was very interesting to her. She expressed that she enjoyed the way the question made her reflect on how representations in media do influence her, even when she (through readings in her former studies) already knew about the power of images. She wrote:

"I thought it was an interesting lecture, but actually I find your question even more interesting. Especially the reaction it provoked in me, or perhaps the fact that it didn't actually provoke a reaction. At first I didn't understand why nothing actually came up, but the second after I understood that this was very logical for me. I have very few special experiences with representations because indeed most representations are like myself."

Later, when Petra continued to reflect on the analysis presented in the web lecture, we identified the emotions of *acceptance*, *pensiveness*, and *interest*. She freely reflected on how media and specifically propaganda in fact possibly do influence her as a woman, even if she believes that it does not. She then expresses to from now onwards continue to reflect on this issue for herself and be alert to it.

In the second part of Petra's diary of this week we identified the emotions of *interest* and *joy* when Petra on her own initiative reflected on the argument presented in the text by Pieterse: the idea that the western image of Africa and black people is an image created by white people, an image that represents a relationship of domination that on its turn has huge societal consequences.

### 9.1.1. Kim

While Kim does briefly address both questions formulated by the course instructor, no emotions were identified this week.

## 10. Week six

In week six students watched an online lecture 'Historical Perspectives' (Grosfoguel, 2013), in which the relation between racism, slavery, and colonialism is examined. They were invited to openly reflect in their diary on the insights the lecture gave them. Students also read the article 'E-Racing slavery: Racial Neoliberalism, Social Forgetting, and Scientific Colonialism in Dutch Primary School History Textbooks' by Weiner (2014). That author examines what stories are shared within Dutch

elementary school history books from 1980 until 2013, and concludes that little to no attention is paid to racism, slavery, and colonization. For reflection in their diaries, the following assignment was shared with the students: ‘Have a look at the history method book used at your internship school. To what extent do you recognize the results of Weiner’s study?’.

### 10.1. Petra

First we observed that reflection on the lecture by Grosfoguel triggered various emotions in Petra. We identified the emotion of *interest* sometimes together with *joy*, when Petra reflected on the new insights the lecture by Grosfoguel gave her and how these link to knowledge and experiences she already had. For example she wrote:

“I think the idea that all of this is connected and that it shouldn’t be seen as separate things, is brilliant. It seems so logical when he says this, but actually we don’t look at it that way. His explanation of why the knowledge all over the world is in the hands of the men stemming from these five countries, is incredibly strong.”

Besides, we identified the emotions of *disapproval*, *grief*, and *anger* when she reflected on the social reality described in the lecture (a reality in which a lot of ‘other’ non-‘western’ knowledge is oppressed and destroyed).

In the remaining part of Petra’s diary of this sixth week we identified the emotions of *apprehension*, *pensiveness*, and *disapproval*. These emotions were identified when she reflected on what her role as a teacher could and should be where it concerns education about slavery, colonialism, and transatlantic human trafficking. While she felt the urge to take action on this topic, she showed *apprehension* and *pensiveness* and expressed not knowing *how* to respond to this and, specifically, how to respond to other people’s reactions (like colleagues and parents) just in case she would take action. She thereby expressed the emotion of *disapproval* regarding the fact that at present she does not act on this.

#### 10.1.1. Kim

We identified the emotions of *acceptance*, *apprehension*, and *interest* in her diary of week 6 when Kim freely reflects on the insights the lecture by Grosfoguel gave her. For example she wrote:

“I myself have always found it logical that we mainly read texts from the Western world, but when I think about it then it is indeed not logical at all. It actually only stimulates the development of a limited vision. Because of the lessons and because of this video, I realized that history as I know it is one-sided and romanticized.”

In the second part of her diary this week the emotions of *acceptance* and *grief* were observed when Kim reflected on the article by Weiner. She expressed the emotion of *acceptance* regarding the new knowledge Weiner’s article presented her with (“I have read the article [by Weiner] and take it for granted.” At the same time we identified the emotion of *grief* when she wrote that she shared the article with her father and reflected on his reaction that reflected a denial of the existence of racism in the Netherlands:

“When I told him that I had a course on this subject, he said that there is no racism in the Netherlands and that slavery had mainly taken place in America. The typical white privilege/ignorant man. I don’t think it really helps to send it [the article written by Weiner], but at least I tried.”

## 11. Week seven, concluding the course

For the seventh week no new study materials were introduced. Instead students were asked to rewrite their reaction to the case presented in week one (see Table 1). They were invited to review their reaction based on insights they got during the course. The following

assignment was shared by the course instructor: “Have a look at the case again and the answer you formulated in week one. Reformulate your answer based on the works we studied in the past six weeks. In your answer, try to make reference to the work we studied as best as you can.”

### 11.1. Petra

In Petra’s last diary we identified the emotions of *anticipation*, *serenity*, and *trust* when she reflected on how it could be prevented from such a case to happen in a classroom in the first place and how she tries to work on this through including certain educational content and creating a certain pedagogical learning climate in her own educational practice. The emotion of *anticipation* was identified when Petra reflected on how change could be set in motion to make more education professionals aware of the existence of racism in education and society. Also Petra expressed the emotions of *anticipation* and *trust* when she responded to the question formulated in week 1 (how she herself would respond as a teacher and personally to the presented case). Here she reflected on what she herself would do in her own classroom when such a case would happen. Finally, we identified the emotion of *disapproval* when Petra reflected on the broader macro context in which education professionals give shape to educational practices and processes. Thereby, she also expressed that at the moment she did not see a role for herself in changing practices of colleague teachers. For example she wrote:

“[] the things that Grosfoguel, Jhally, van Dijk, Vasta, and Time Wise mention are all very structural, you can’t change that on your own. In order to change such things, one needs great breaking through changes []. They are long-term changes. That is why it is difficult to really bring about a change amongst colleagues, who have internalized structural racism. []”

#### 11.1.1. Kim

We identified the emotions of *anticipation*, *trust*, and *serenity* when Kim reformulated her reply to the first question shared by the course instructor in week 1 (*how she would respond as a teacher and personally to the presented case*). For example, in the next quote, when Kim reflected on what she would do in such a case, we identified the emotion of *anticipation*:

“I would first ask my colleague what she thinks of the situation in order to gauge their background knowledge on this subject. Assuming that the teacher knows nothing about this, I would start the conversation in the first place. I would keep in mind that, as Weiner describes, that the Dutch are generally ignorant of their history about slavery. I would try to sense what kind of help my colleague is looking for. Does he or she want a practical solution to the problem? Does he or she want to know where these kinds of comments come from? Does he or she want to teach the students about why these kinds of comments are inappropriate considering our history?”

While Kim continued to respond to the assignment, the emotion of *trust* was identified when she expressed that, when she would try to ‘help her colleague out’, she will in an indirect way build on the knowledge she obtained during this course. The emotion of *trust* was also identified when Kim reflected back on what the course provided her with. The emotion of *interest* was identified when Kim referred to Bergman’s documentary. Finally, the emotions of *interest*, *joy*, and *optimism* were observed in the final phases of Kim’s diary, when she reflected on what, in a more general way, she learned during this course. She ended her diary by writing:

“Many people indicated during the lesson that the documentary would be too confrontational, but as you may have noticed, I like it when information is confrontational. I think that leads to new

thoughts and ultimately changes your mind. In any case, this course has worked well for me;)"

## 12. Discussion

The aim of our study was to provide insight into the emotional responses of white student teachers during a Critical Race Theory (CRT) based course. Specifically, we addressed the following research question: How do emotional responses arise among white Dutch student teachers during a CRT based course? Data for this study consisted of the diaries written by the student teachers during the course. In their diaries, students answered guiding questions and assignments shared by the course instructor. We focused on the diaries of two students, as this provided us an opportunity to more closely look at the nuances of the emotional responses of student teachers in relation to different ways in which they engage with the course content.

Using Plutchik's (2001) classification of emotions to answer the research question, we found that both students expressed various emotions throughout the course. We identified 16 of the 32 emotions of Plutchik's classification. The emotions interest, acceptance, disapproval, and pensiveness were most identified (respectively 9, 8, 8, and 8 times), whereas the emotions ecstasy, love, admiration, submission, terror, fear, awe, distraction, sadness, loathing, disgust, boredom, contempt, rage, aggressiveness, and vigilance were not observed. An analysis of students learning diaries based on Plutchik's emotions in the context of a course about gender issues revealed a similar variety in emotions expressed including joy and trust (Treceña, 2019).

In line with previous studies using Plutchik's framework to understand how white and students of color experience a sense of belonging in their study program (e.g. Glass et al., 2015), our data showed that the number of different emotions varies across weeks. For instance, Kim expressed three different emotions in week 1, in week 4 she expressed ten different emotions, and in week 5 none. Similar to other studies (e.g., Grün et al., 2013; Matias et al., 2017), this finding suggests that during a course the number of different emotions can fluctuate over time. Moreover, our study confirms that students' experienced emotions can also appear in different combinations. For instance, the emotion apprehension was found in combination with the emotions acceptance and anticipation in one week, but also in combination with the emotions amazement, annoyance, disapproval, grief, pensiveness, and remorse in another week (see Kim in Table 3). This resonates with previous studies which also found that multiple emotions can occur simultaneously and in various combinations (e.g., de Oliveira Andreotti et al., 2014; Anttila et al., 2016). Indeed, the results of this study provide evidence for the idea that emotions can be congruent (e.g., Petra in Week 2: optimism and interest), but also contradictory (e.g., Petra in Week 4: optimism and disapproval).

Regarding the idea that student teachers go through certain phases in their process of becoming anti-racist, our data did not yield a straightforward path that the students emotionally go through. Results of our study add support to de Oliveira Andreotti et al.'s study (2014), which found that white student teachers in the context of a CRT based course do not necessarily process emotions through fixed anti-racist development stages. In addition to de Oliveira Andreotti et al. (2014), we found that over and within weeks the two students expressed emotions that could be classified as comfortable (e.g., interest, joy, and acceptance) as well as emotions that could be classified as uncomfortable (e.g., grief, disapproval, and remorse) with no clear order. For instance, when comparing Petra's diary of week 1, week 2 and, week 3, we found that in week 1 she expressed three comfort related emotions (e.g., acceptance) and one emotion that could be related to discomfort (disapproval), whereas in week 2 she expresses two emotions that could be related to discomfort (e.g., grief) next to eight comfort related emotions (e.g., optimism), and in week 3 five comfort related emotions (e.g., joy).

Since we have observed the continuous variety of both comfortable

and uncomfortable emotions during the weeks, we have not seen students shutting themselves off completely from learning about race and racism during the course. This may suggest the opposite of what has been addressed in other studies about white student teachers discussing racism and whiteness (e.g., Lander, 2011; Smith, 2014). Moreover, we observed both Kim and Petra predominantly expressing comfortable emotions (e.g., serenity and trust) towards the end of the course. This observation is aligned with the findings of de Oliveira Andreotti et al. (2014), Hill (2012), and Sleeter (2001) that during a CRT based course, white students often progress toward greater understanding of CRT-related concepts, and ultimately express more comfortable emotions such as joy. Nevertheless, our analysis of Kim's case shows that at some moments, triggered by specific course content, a temporary 'emotional closure' from learning can occur. This points to the possibility that when students focus on difficulties, paradoxes, and contradictions related to racism and other forms of exclusion, they might temporarily experience a feeling of paralysis (de Oliveira Andreotti et al., 2014).

Although we found similar emotional responses in both students' diaries during the CRT based course, we noted that they expressed these emotional responses while being connected to the course content in a different way (for an overview see Appendix 1). Next to previous studies about the importance of how white students can relate to CRT related course content (e.g., Haddix & Price-Dennis, 2013; Sleeter, 2017), we identified four different ways of connecting to the course content: 1) directly reflecting on the case or answering questions or assignments introduced by the course instructor; 2) reflecting on elements of the course content on own initiative; 3) relating elements of the course content to reflections on own personal or professional experience on own initiative; and 4) reflecting on the relation between elements of the course content and social reality around them on own initiative.

First, we observed that both students during the course expressed emotions when they connected to the course content by directly reflecting on the case or answering questions or assignments introduced by the course instructor. In fact, in general, throughout almost all weeks we observed both students expressing emotions when responding to the assignment or questions formulated by the course instructor. This even seems the only way to connect with the course content in week 1.

Second, we observed that Petra from week 2 onwards often expressed emotions when reflecting on the course content on her own initiative, while we noted that Kim did this less frequently. For example, already in week 2 Petra expressed different emotions when, on her own initiative, she reflected on the web lecture and literature and compared it with her own prior knowledge, specifically her understanding of the concepts of discourse, racism, and elites. In the same week, Kim once expressed emotions when reflecting on the course content on her own initiative, however this happened when she reflected on the learning goals of the course in a broader sense.

Third, looking at when students express emotions when relating the course content to their own personal or professional experiences on their own initiative, Petra did this less and only later on in the course, while Kim did this more and already earlier in the course. In the beginning of the course it already seemed that Petra was familiar with reflecting on her own personal and professional race-related experiences and such experiences of friends and relatives. Hence she did not express emotions doing this. However, from week 5 onwards, Petra did express emotions related to her professional role, specifically when she reflects on how as a professional she could get colleagues to participate in the development of anti-racist education.

Finally, regarding emotions that are accompanied by reflections on social reality on own initiative, we found Kim expressing emotions in week 2 when she compared the course content with her own observations of social reality. As in Petra's case, in week 7 she expressed emotions as she reflects on the limitations that social reality still imposes on her when it comes to further development as a teacher working on anti-racist education.

As in [Garmon's theoretical study \(2005\)](#) on white student teachers' beliefs and values about diversity, our findings show that while white student teachers may be similar in terms of racial and gender background, they respond differently to a CRT based course. Importantly this shows that emotions in themselves do not exist in a vacuum, but should be understood in relation to how students differently connect and therefore give meaning to the course content (cf. [Major & Brock, 2003](#); [Pattnaik, 1997](#)). Hence, identifying emotions during a CRT based course is a necessary first step, but needs to be complemented with a contextual analysis of those emotions (cf. [Mesquita & Boiger, 2014](#); [Chatterjee et al., 2019](#)), in which we look deeper into how students emotionally relate and respond to the CRT course content.

An important source of the differences observed between the two students seems to lie in their biographies (cf. [Kelchtermans, 2009](#)). Specifically, we found that their educational backgrounds seemed to matter in how they emotionally connected to the course content. Petra, being two years older than Kim, lived in different contexts within and outside the Netherlands and studied anthropology, there also learning about racism and other forms of structural exclusion. Kim, coming to live in the city straight from her parents' house, rolled into the teacher program right after high school where such matters were not part of the curriculum.

### 13. Limitations

Our findings should be interpreted in the context of three main limitations. First, we recognize the cultural and social context and theoretical limitations in which Plutchik's (2001) categorization of emotions was defined. However, we decided to use this framework as it includes a wide spectrum of emotions and recognizes that emotions can occur both simultaneously and sequentially, can be of opposite valence, and change in a nonlinear manner. Hence, this classification offered us the opportunity to make a first step to identify the variety and complexity of emotions white student teachers experience during a CRT based course. Future studies, using a similar framework, can provide additional support for the use of Plutchik's (2001) categorization across different cultural and social contexts as well as empirical support for our study.

Second, despite the fact that we used a suitable theoretical framework, there was still the possibility of interpreting emotions ambiguously. For instance, nuances in the meaning of text by the use of humor or sarcasm, remained sometimes difficult for us to recognize. This at some points complicated our interpretation of the diaries and consequently the identification of emotions. Additionally, also our own theoretical, disciplinary, and cultural backgrounds influence how we give meaning to emotions.

In the current study, we have strived to minimize ambiguity in the interpretation of emotions as much as possible in different ways. We operationalized the different emotions in detail, describing them in observable phenomena and using the Atlas ti memo writing tool (cf. [van der Groot et al., 2012](#)). Besides, we held regular discussion sessions to discuss our interpretations, studying the meaning of the text at the level of words, phrases, sentences and larger units of text. Yet, the interpretation of emotions in text remains difficult due to the lack of facial expression and the use of voice and sound ([Chatterjee et al., 2019](#)). New studies in this area could use classroom observations and/or video-recording as complementary data.

Finally, although we initially read 36 diaries, we base our conclusions on the detailed analysis of the diaries of two students. A qualitative study of more diaries could have provided a more comprehensive understanding of the emotional responses of white student teachers during this CRT based course. As conducting such a type of qualitative research is very time consuming, perhaps new technology such as deep learning algorithms could in the future be helpful in the qualitative analysis of text in more diaries (cf. [Chatterjee et al., 2019](#)).

### 14. Research implications

This research has underpinned the value of analyzing student teachers' emotional responses on a weekly basis during a CRT based course. Although we provided insights into the variety and changeability of emotional responses of the student teachers and how they relate to the course content when expressing these emotions, an important question to be answered remains how this is related to their actual teaching practice (cf. [Neville et al., 2014](#)). Future research could go further by focusing on answering this question.

Second, whereas both student teachers end the course with predominantly comfortable emotions, future research should examine how long they can hold these emotions when they find themselves in contexts outside the course. It is feasible that students add experiences that confirm and strengthen these emotions. On the other hand, new experiences might also contradict the emotions that students experienced at the end of the course. In the extreme, new experiences can lead to forms of white rage and 'reverse racism' ([Nagle, 2017](#)). This highlights that backlash can take place as well after completing a CRT based course ([Hughes, 2014](#)).

Finally, it would be relevant for future research to focus on the emotional responses of student teachers that belong to historical underrepresented groups, such as students with an ethnic minority background and/or students with a LGBTQIA+ identity. There is evidence that CRT courses are experienced emotionally differently by students of historical underrepresented groups compared to students belonging to the dominant (white) group (e.g., [Giwa & Greensmith, 2012](#)), however such studies remain scarce within the West-European context.

### 15. Practical implications

This study has several practical implications for teacher educators who want to make white student teachers racially aware and stimulate understanding of the implications of whiteness, power structures, privilege, and racism. Although the students are white, they can enter the course with different identities and biographies, including previous subjects and courses taken, as well as indirect personal experiences of students, either by family and/or friends. This might imply that they react differently to the course content. Hence, when designing such a course, it is important to take this into account. One way to do this is by conducting intake interviews with white students asking about theoretical knowledge about and personal experiences with racism and other forms of exclusion. Another possibility is to determine the starting point of students on the basis of an analysis of emotions expressed in reaction to a case similar to the one introduced in the course of our study.

Second, because not all educational contexts offer the possibility to make these investments before the starting of the course, we would suggest teacher educators to depart from a flexible course design. Depending on students' starting points, teachers should differentiate both in content and tasks. A logical design of such a flexible course could be characterized by the following sequence of content: 1) content that helps to recognize racism within the personal and professional context, 2) content that helps to get insight into the elusive construct of racism, and 3) content that help students to place issues in a larger socio-historical context.

Third, based on the finding that student teachers develop emotionally and learn differently from each other, we suggest that designing appropriate learning pathways and assessing students can no longer solely rely on conventional approaches and criteria, in which entire cohorts of students follow the same program, study the same content, and are assessed in the same way (cf. [Heeneman et al., 2021](#); [Tigelaar et al., 2005](#)). A more tailor-made program could be especially important for student teachers who learn about racism: a process that can be viewed as unique, dynamic, and ongoing throughout their professional career and in which learning with and from students, communities, and colleagues plays a crucial role (cf. [Smith, 2020](#)). Therefore, in terms of

curriculum decisions, our results lean towards a preference of constructivist principles to curriculum design, where there is more opportunity for longitudinal and self-directed learning, meaningful and authentic exploration, and engaging in interactive group activities, in combination with modern assessment tools such as portfolios (e.g., Tigelaar et al., 2005; Valcke, 2018).

Finally, we embrace the idea that white primary student teachers are able to learn about racism and other forms of oppression even during a mandatory CRT based course, especially when they experience the time and space to share their emotions (cf. Aronson & Meyers, 2022). During this course we found the use of diaries in combination with the selected course materials valuable. Teacher educators who want to build upon our course are invited to view our materials in Table 1 and the reference list for ideas.

**16. Conclusion**

The aim of this qualitative study was to provide insight into how emotional responses arise among white teacher students during a compulsory CRT based course in a Dutch teacher training program. Following Plutchik’s (2001) classification, we identified 16 out of the 32

emotions in their diaries, of which the emotions of interest, acceptance, disapproval and pensiveness were most present. Besides that the number of emotions fluctuates over time, the combinations and congruency of more or less comfortable emotions varied, without detecting a clear emotional path white students go through. In addition, although both student teachers identified as white, they emotionally responded differently during the CRT based course content due to their biographies. Indeed, both students showed similar emotions and predominantly comfortable emotions towards the end of the course, the timing and trigger for those emotions seemed to differ and they experienced different difficulties, paradoxes, and contradictions related to the CRT content. Thereby, we found that the students connected to the course content in different ways. Therefore, teacher educators focusing on teaching about racism should give individual student teachers sufficient time and space to share their emotions during a CRT based course, for example through the use of diaries in combination with assignments which help them to reflect on ‘what they feel’ next to ‘what they have learned’. We believe that facilitating both the emotional and cognitive domains of learning hold the potential to help students to become critical primary teachers.

**Appendix 1. Overview of types of reflections and co-occurrence with different emotions**

Types of reflections	Petra	Kim
1) Directly reflecting on the case or answering questions or assignments introduced by the course instructor	Amazement	Acceptance
	Disapproval	Apprehension
	Anticipation	Anticipation
	Acceptance	Disapproval
	Interest	Grief
	Serenity	Pensiveness
	Grief	Annoyance
	Pensiveness	Optimism
	Surprise	Grief
	Optimism	Interest
	Remorse	Joy
	Joy	Trust
	Trust	Serenity
		Interest
		Annoyance
	2) Reflecting on elements of the course content on own initiative	Grief
Acceptance		Remorse
Optimism		Grief
Trust		Amazement
Pensiveness		Pensiveness
Joy		Interest
Amazement		Joy
Serenity		Acceptance
Disapproval		
Anger		
Acceptance	Apprehension	
Optimism	Pensiveness	
Trust	Annoyance	
3) Relating elements of the course content to reflections on own personal or professional experience on own initiative	Apprehension	Disapproval
	Pensiveness	Amazement
	Disapproval	Acceptance
	anticipation	Apprehension
	Serenity	
	Disapproval	Acceptance
4) Reflecting on the relation between elements of the course content and social reality around them on own initiative		Disapproval
		Grief
		Remorse

**References**

References marked with an asterisk indicate studies included in the course.  
 Agirdag, O., Merry, M. S., & Van Houtte, M. (2016). Teachers’ understanding of multicultural education and the correlates of multicultural content integration in

Flanders. *Education and Urban Society*, 48(6), 556–582. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0013124514536610>  
 Anttila, H., Pyhältö, K., Soini, T., & Pietarinen, J. (2016). How does it feel to become a teacher? Emotions in teacher education. *Social Psychology of Education*, 19(3), 451–473.

- Apfelbaum, E. P., Pauker, K., Sommers, S. R., & Ambady, N. (2010). In blind pursuit of racial equality. *Psychological Science*, 21(11), 1587–1592. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797610384471>
- Aronson, B., & Meyers, L. (2022). Critical race theory and the teacher education curriculum: Challenging understandings of racism, whiteness, and white supremacy. *Whiteness and Education*, 7(1), 32–57.
- Aronson, B., Meyers, L., & Winn, V. (2020). "Lies my teacher [educator] still tells": Using critical race counternarratives to disrupt whiteness in teacher education. *The Teacher Educator*, 55(3), 300–322.
- \*Bergman, S. (2014). Zwart als Roet [Our Colonial Hangover] [Film].
- Bowen, G. A. (2008). Naturalistic inquiry and the saturation concept: A research note. *Qualitative Research*, 8(1), 137–152.
- Bowen, G. A. (2009). Document analysis as a qualitative research method. *Qualitative Research Journal*, 9(2), 27–40.
- Budiyanto, C., Prananto, A., & Tan, F. T. C. (2019). Designing embedded case study research approach in educational research. *International Journal of Pedagogy and Teacher Education*, 3(1), 1–18.
- Chatterjee, A., Gupta, U., Chinnakotla, M. K., Srikanth, R., Galley, M., & Agrawal, P. (2019). Understanding emotions in text using deep learning and big data. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 93, 309–317. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2018.12.029>
- Cole, M. (2017). *Critical race theory and education: A Marxist response*. Springer.
- Davis, D. E. (2009). Preparing white student teachers through a critical consultative interaction model. *International Journal of Progressive Education*, 5(2), n2.
- DeCuir-Gunby, J. T., Allen, E. M., & Boone, J. K. (2020). Examining pre-service teachers' color-blind racial ideology, emotion regulation, and inflexibility with stigmatizing thoughts about race. *Contemporary Educational Psychology*, 60, Article 101836.
- Delano-Oriaran, O. O., & Parks, M. W. (2015). One black, one white: Power, white privilege, & creating safe spaces. *Multicultural Education*, 22(3/4), 15–19.
- Dixson, A. D., & Rousseau, C. K. (2005). And we are still not saved: Critical race theory in education ten years later. *Race Ethnicity and Education*, 8(1), 7–27. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1361332052000340971>
- Eriksen, K. G., & Stein, S. (2021). Good intentions, colonial relations: Interrupting the white emotional equilibrium of Norwegian citizenship education. *Review of Education, Pedagogy, and Cultural Studies*, 1–21. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10714413.2021.1959210>
- Esajas, M., & de Abreu, J. (2019). The Black Archives: Exploring the Politics of Black Dutch Radicals. *Open Cultural Studies*, 3(1), 402–413.
- Essed, P., & Hoving, I. (Eds.). (2014). *Dutch racism* (Vol. 27). Rodopi.
- Garmon, M. A. (2005). Six key factors for changing preservice teachers' attitudes/beliefs about diversity. *Educational Studies*, 38(3), 275–286.
- Gillborn, D., & Ladson-Billings, G. (2020). *Critical race theory*. SAGE Publications Limited.
- Giwa, S., & Greensmith, C. (2012). Race relations and racism in the LGBTQ community of Toronto: Perceptions of gay and queer social service providers of color. *Journal of Homosexuality*, 59(2), 149–185. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00918369.2012.648877>
- Glass, C. R., Kocielek, E., Wongtrirat, R., Lynch, R. J., & Cong, S. (2015). Uneven Experiences: The Impact of Student-Faculty Interactions on International Students' Sense of Belonging. *Journal of International Studies*, 5(4), 353–367.
- Gorski, P. (2008). The Myth of the "Culture of Poverty". *Educational Leadership*, 65(7), 32.
- (\*) Grosfoguel, R. (2013). The structure of knowledge in westernized universities: Epistemic racism/sexism and the four genocides/epistemicides of the long 16th century. *Human architecture*, 11(1), 73.
- Grüth, D., Lumley, M. A., Diehl, M., & Labouvie-Vief, G. (2013). Time-based indicators of emotional complexity: Interrelations and correlates. *Emotion*, 13(2), 226.
- Gundara, J. S., & Portera, A. (2008). Theoretical reflections on intercultural education. *Intercultural Education*, 19(6), 63–468. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14675980802568244>
- Haddix, M., & Price-Dennis, D. (2013). Urban fiction and multicultural literature as transformative tools for preparing English teachers for diverse classrooms. *English Education*, 45(3), 247–283.
- Hambacher, E., & Ginn, K. (2021). Race-visible teacher education: A review of the literature from 2002 to 2018. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 72(3), 329–341.
- Hanna, F., Oostdam, R., Severiens, S. E., & Zijlstra, B. J. (2019). Primary student teachers' professional identity tensions: The construction and psychometric quality of the professional identity tensions scale. *Studies in Educational Evaluation*, 61, 21–33.
- Hanna, F., Oostdam, R., Severiens, S. E., & Zijlstra, B. J. (2022). The development of the relationship between professional identity tensions and teacher identity: A quantitative longitudinal study among Dutch primary student teachers. *Studies in Educational Evaluation*, 75, Article 101199.
- Heeneman, S., de Jong, L.H., Dawson, L.J., Wilkinson, T.J., Ryan, A., Tait, G.R., & van der Vleuten, C.P. (2021). Ottawa 2020 consensus statement for programmatic assessment—1. Agreement on the principles. *Medical Teacher*, 43(10), 1139–1148.
- Hill, K. D. (2012). We're actually comfortable with diversity: Affirming teacher candidates for culturally relevant reading pedagogy in urban practicum. *Action in Teacher Education*, 34(5–6), 420–432.
- Howard, T., & Rodriguez-Scheel, A. (2017). Culturally relevant pedagogy 20 years later: Progress or pontification? What have we learned, and where do we go? *Teachers College Record*, 119(1), 1–32.
- Howard, T. C., & Reynolds, R. (2008). Examining parent involvement in reversing the underachievement of African American students in middle-class schools. *Educational Foundations*, 22, 79–98.
- Hsieh, H. F., & Shannon, S. E. (2005). Three approaches to qualitative content analysis. *Qualitative Health Research*, 15(9), 1277–1288.
- Hughey, M. W. (2014). White backlash in the 'post-racial' United States. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 37(5), 721–730.
- \*\*Hurt, B. (2006). *Hip-Hop: Beyond Beats and Rhymes* [FILM].
- \*Jhally, S. (2010, November 10) Honors Colloquium: "Why America Can't Think Straight About Race (Even with a Black President) [Video]. YouTube. Honors Colloquium: "Why America Can't Think Straight About Race (Even with a Black President)"
- \*Jhally, S. (2013, December 3). COMM 288. Why images matter? [Video]. Vimeo. COMM 288 - Lecture 5 - Why Images Matter.
- Johnson, L. (2002). "My eyes have been opened" White teachers and racial awareness. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 53(2), 153–167.
- Kelchtermans, G. (2009). Who I am in how I teach is the message: self-understanding, vulnerability and reflection. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, 15(2), 257–272. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13540600902875332>
- Kelchtermans, G., & Deketelaere, A. (2016). The emotional dimension in becoming a teacher. In *International handbook of teacher education* (pp. 429–461). Singapore: Springer.
- Kennedy, B. L., Habraken, M., & Melfor, S. N. (2023). Assaults on belonging: how Dutch youth without 'blue eyes, cheese, and clogs' experience everyday racism in educational contexts. *Race Ethnicity and Education*, 26(5), 642–662.
- Ladson-Billings, G., & Tate, W. F. (2016). Toward a critical race theory of education. In *Critical race theory in education* (pp. 10–31). Routledge.
- Lander, V. (2011). Race, culture and all that: an exploration of the perspectives of White secondary student teachers about race equality issues in their initial teacher education. *Race Ethnicity and Education*, 14(3), 351–364.
- Larkin, K., & Jorgensen, R. (2016). 'I hate maths: why do we need to do maths?' Using iPad video diaries to investigate attitudes and emotions towards mathematics in year 3 and year 6 students. *International Journal of Science and Mathematics Education*, 14(5), 925–944.
- Lawrence, S., & Tatum, B. (1997). Teachers in transition: The impact of anti-racist professional development on classroom practice. *Teachers College Record*, 99(1), 162–178.
- Major, E. M., & Brock, C. H. (2003). Fostering positive dispositions toward diversity: Dialogical explorations of a moral dilemma. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 30(4), 7–26.
- Marx, S., & Pennington, J. (2003). Pedagogies of critical race theory: Experimentations with white preservice teachers. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 16(1), 91–110. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0951839022000036381>
- Matias, C. E., Henry, A., & Darland, C. (2017). The Twin Tales of Whiteness: Exploring the Emotional Roller Coaster of Teaching and Learning about Whiteness. *Taboo. The Journal of Culture and Education*, 16(1). <https://doi.org/10.31390/taboo.16.1.04>
- McIntyre, A. (1997). Constructing an Image of a White Teacher. *Teachers College Record*, 98(4), 653–81.
- Mesquita, B., & Boiger, M. (2014). Emotions in context: A sociodynamic model of emotions. *Emotion Review*, 6(4), 298–302. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1754073914534480>
- Mikander, P., Zilliacus, H., & Holm, G. (2018). Intercultural education in transition: Nordic perspectives. *Education Inquiry*, 9(1), 40–56. <https://doi.org/10.1080/20004508.2018.1433432>
- Muhr, T. (2004). ATLAS.ti (Version 7) [Software]. Available from <http://atlasti.com>
- Nagle, J. (2017). On intersectionality: Decolonization, inclusion, and diversity-focused pedagogies. *Canadian Journal for New Scholars in Education/Revue canadienne des jeunes chercheurs et chercheurs Eno'sis éducation*, 8, 1.
- Neville, H. A., Poteat, V. P., Lewis, J. A., & Spanierman, L. B. (2014). Changes in White college students' color-blind racial ideology over 4 years: Do diversity experiences make a difference? *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 61(2), 179. <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0035168>
- de Oliveira Andreotti, V., Fa'afai, A., Sitomaniemi-San, J., & Ahenakew, C. (2014). Cognition, affect and relationality: experiences of student teachers in a course on multiculturalism in primary teacher education in Aotearoa/New Zealand. *Race Ethnicity and Education*, 17(5), 706–728. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13613324.2012.759920>
- Pattnaik, J. (1997). Cultural stereotypes and preservice education: Moving beyond our biases. *Equity and Excellence in Education*, 30(3), 40–50. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1066568970300307>
- Pekrun, R. (2014). Emotions and learning. *Educational Practices Series*, 24(1), 1–31.
- Pezzetti, K. (2017). 'I'm not racist; my high school was diverse!' white preservice teachers deploy diversity in the classroom. *Whiteness and Education*, 2(2), 131–147. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23793406.2017.1362944>
- \*Pieterse, J. N. (1992). *White on black: Images of Africa and blacks in western popular culture*. Yale University Press.
- Plutchik, R. (1992). The nature of emotions: Human emotions have deep evolutionary roots, a fact that may explain their complexity and provide tools for clinical practice. *American scientist*, 89(4), 344–350.
- Savenije, G., Van Bostel, C., & Grever, M. (2014). Sensitive 'heritage' of slavery in a multicultural classroom: Pupils' ideas regarding significance. *British Journal of Educational Studies*, 62(2), 127–148. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00071005.2014.910292>
- Severiens, S., Wolff, R., & van Herpen, S. (2014). Teaching for diversity: a literature overview and an analysis of the curriculum of a teacher training college. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 37(3), 295–311.
- Simons, H. (2009). *Case study research in practice*. SAGE publications.
- Sleeter, C. E. (2001). Preparing teachers for culturally diverse schools: Research and the overwhelming presence of whiteness. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 52(2), 94–106. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487101052002002>
- Sleeter, C. E. (2017). Critical race theory and the whiteness of teacher education. *Urban Education*, 52(2), 155–169. <https://doi.org/10.1177/004208591666895>
- Smith, A. N. (2020). Critical race theory: Disruption in teacher education pedagogy. *Journal of Culture and Values in Education*, 3(1), 52–71.



- Smith, H. J. (2014). Emotional responses to documentary viewing and the potential for transformative teaching. *Teaching Education*, 25(2), 217–238. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10476210.2012.762351>
- Solomona, R. P., Portelli, J. P., Daniel, B. J., & Campbell, A. (2005). The discourse of denial: How white teacher candidates construct race, racism and 'white privilege'. *Race ethnicity and Education*, 8(2), 147–169. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13613320500110519>
- \*Spanierman, L. B., & Cabrera, N. L. (2015). The emotions of White racism and antiracism. Unveiling Whiteness in the 21st century: Global manifestations, transdisciplinary interventions, 9-28.
- Svendsen, S. H. B. (2014). Learning racism in the absence of 'race'. *European Journal of Women's Studies*, 21(1), 9–24. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1350506813507717>
- Tatum, B. (1992). Talking about race, learning about racism: The application of racial identity development theory in the classroom. *Harvard Educational Review*, 62(1), 1–25.
- \*\*Telzer, E. H., Humphreys, K. L., Shapiro, M., & Tottenham, N. (2013). Amygdala sensitivity to race is not present in childhood but emerges over adolescence. *Journal of cognitive neuroscience*, 25(2), 234–244.
- Thijs, J., & Verkuyten, M. (2013). Multiculturalism in the classroom: Ethnic attitudes and classmates' beliefs. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 37(2), 176–187. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijintrel.2012.04.012>
- Tigelaar, D. E., Dolmans, D. H., Wolfhagen, I. H., & van der Vleute, C. P. (2005). Quality issues in judging portfolios: Implications for organizing teaching portfolio assessment procedures. *Studies in Higher Education*, 30(5), 595–610.
- Trecheñe, J. K. (2019). Delving The Sentiments To Track Emotions In Gender Issues: A Plutchik Based Sentiment Analysis In Students' Learning Diaries. *International Journal of Scientific & Technology Research*, 8(12), 1134–1139.
- Valcke, M. (2018). Onderwijskunde als ontwerpwetenschap: van leren naar instructie: deel 1. Acco.
- Van Der Goot, M., Beentjes, J. W., & Van Selm, M. (2012). Meanings of television in older adults' lives: an analysis of change and continuity in television viewing. *Ageing & Society*, 32(1), 147–168.
- Van der Pijl, Y., & Goulordava, K. (2014). Black pete, "smug ignorance," and the value of the black body in postcolonial Netherlands. *New West Indian Guide/Nieuwe West-Indische Gids*, 88(3–4), 262–291.
- \*van Dijk, T. A. (1987). Elite discourse and racism. In I. Zavala, T. A. van Dijk, & M. DiazDiocaretz (Eds.), *Approaches to discourse, poetics and psychiatry* (pp. 81–122). Amsterdam: Benjamins.
- \*\*Vasta, E. (2007). From ethnic minorities to ethnic majority policy: Multiculturalism and the shift to assimilationism in the Netherlands. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 30(5), 713–740.
- Weiner, M. F. (2015). Whiteness a diverse Dutch classroom: white cultural discourses in an Amsterdam primary school. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 38(2), 359–376. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.2014.894200>
- \*\*Weiner, M. F. (2015). (E) RACING SLAVERY: Racial Neoliberalism, Social Forgetting, and Scientific Colonialism in Dutch Primary School History Textbooks1.. *Du Bois Review Social Science Research on Race*, 11(2), 329–351.
- Wekker, G. (2017). Witte onschuld: paradoxen van kolonialisme en ras. Amsterdam University Press.
- Wilkins, C. (2001). Student Teachers and Attitudes towards 'Race': the role of citizenship education in addressing racism through the curriculum. *Westminster Studies in Education*, 24(1), 7–21.
- \*\*Wise, T. (Director). (2013). White Like Me. Race, Racism, & White Privilege in America [Film].
- Yin, R. K. (2009). How to do better case studies. *The SAGE handbook of applied social research methods*, 2(254–282).
- Zembylas, M. (2012). Pedagogies of strategic empathy: Navigating through the emotional complexities of anti-racism in higher education. *Teaching in Higher Education*, 17(2), 113–125. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13562517.2011.61186>